100 E-Bus Trial Jakarta
Gender and LNOB Analysis

February 12, 2021
ABOUT THE C40 CITIES FINANCE FACILITY

The C40 Cities Finance Facility (CFF) is a collaboration of the C40 Cities Climate Leadership Group and Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH. The CFF supports cities in developing and emerging economies to develop finance-ready projects to reduce emissions to limit global temperature rise to 1.5°C and strengthen resilience against the impacts of a warming climate. The CFF is funded by the German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ), the Children’s Investment Fund Foundation (CIFF), the Government of the United Kingdom and the United States Agency for International Development (USAID).

Published by:
C40 Cities Finance Facility
Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH

Registered offices
Bonn and Eschborn, Germany
Potsdamer Platz 10
10785 Berlin, Germany

E contact@c40cff.org
W c40cff.org

Author/Responsible/Editor:
GFA/ HEAT GmbH
Habitat, Energy, Application & Technology
Seilerbahnweg 14
61462 Koenigstein, Germany

Bonn, 2021
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABOUT THE C40 CITIES FINANCE FACILITY ................................................................. I

LIST OF FIGURES ............................................................................................................ III

LIST OF TABLES ............................................................................................................... III

LIST OF ACRONYMS ....................................................................................................... IV

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY ................................................................................................. V

BACKGROUND ................................................................................................................. V

Emerging Findings ......................................................................................................... V

1. INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................................... 1

   1.1 Background ............................................................................................................. 1

   1.2 Objective ............................................................................................................... 2

   1.3 Methodology ......................................................................................................... 2

   1.4 Structure of the Report ......................................................................................... 4

2. GENDER AND VULNERABILITY IN THE URBAN TRANSPORT SECTOR .......... 5

   2.1 The Linkages Between Gender/Social Exclusion and Transport Systems: The Global Context ................................................................................. 5

   2.2 Gender and Vulnerability in the Transport Sector: The Indonesian Context ............................................................................................................ 7

   2.3 Spotlight Issue – Women’s and Marginalized People’s Safety & Gender-Based Violence ................................................... 9

3. EMERGING FINDINGS: GENDER AND MARGINALITY PROVISIONS AND GAPS IN THE TRANSJAKARTA SYSTEM ........................................................................ 11

   3.1 Methodology ......................................................................................................... 11

   3.2 Existing TransJakarta Provisions for Women and Marginalized Populations ........................................................................................................... 11

   3.3 Gaps Related to the Inclusion of Women and Marginalized Populations in the TransJakarta System .......................................................... 17

4. 100 E-BUS TRIAL’S RISKS AND MITIGATION STRATEGIES .................................... 20

   4.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................... 20

   4.2 Potential Social Impacts ....................................................................................... 20

   4.3 Risk Identification and Mitigation .................................................................... 20

5. RECOMMENDATIONS .............................................................................................. 23

ANNEX 1 POLICIES ON GENDER EQUALITY AND SOCIAL INCLUSION IN TRANSPORT IN INDONESIA .......... 27

ANNEX 2 DEFINITIONS AND KEY CONCEPTS USED IN THE STUDY ......................... 29

ANNEX 3 SPATIAL POVERTY DISAGGREGATION WITHIN JAKARTA ......................... 30

ANNEX 4 TENTATIVE GENDER ACTION PLAN .............................................................. 32

   A.4.1 Introduction .................................................................................................. 32

   A.4.2 Tentative Gender Action Plan .................................................................... 32

ANNEX 5 LIST OF INDIVIDUALS CONSULTED .............................................................. 36

   A.5.1 Individuals Consultations ............................................................................ 36

ANNEX 6 PRIMARY DATA COLLECTION AND ASSESSMENT ................................... 37

   A.6.1 Gender Organisational Assessment ......................................................... 37

BIBLIOGRAPHY ............................................................................................................. 40
LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE 1. STAGES IN MAINSTREAMING GENDER CONCERNS IN ENERGY PROJECTS  3
FIGURE 2. TRANSJAKARTA FLEET OPERATIONS AND COMPOSITION         12
FIGURE 3. TRANSJAKARTA ROUTE NETWORK EVOLUTION                    13
FIGURE 4. TRANSJAKARTA BUS DISABILITY ACCESSIBLE INTERIOR DESIGN    14
FIGURE 5. METROTRANS BUS WITH LOW FLOORS                           16
FIGURE 6. WHERE ARE THE POOR AND VULNERABLE LOCATED IN JAKARTA? (SHARE OF TOTAL POOR AND VULNERABLE BY PLACE, %)  31
FIGURE 7. ELEMENTS OF A TENTATIVE GENDER ACTION PLAN                32

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE 1: GENDER AND LEAVE NO ONE BEHIND: TARGET GROUPS AND THEIR INFORMATION NEEDS  21
TABLE 2: POVERTY RATES IN JAKARTA                                         30
TABLE 3: LIST OF INDIVIDUALS CONSULTED                                      36
# LIST OF ACRONYMS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>APBN</td>
<td>Anggaran Pendapatan dan Belanja Negara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPNT</td>
<td>Bantuan Pangan Non Tunai (food security assistance)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRT</td>
<td>Bus Rapid Transit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCTV</td>
<td>Closed Circuit Television</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFF</td>
<td>Cities Finance Facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COVID</td>
<td>Corona Virus Disease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO2</td>
<td>Carbon Dioxide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DKI Jakarta</td>
<td>Daerah Khusus Ibukota or Special Capital Region of Jakarta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-Bus</td>
<td>Electric bus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAO</td>
<td>Food and Agriculture Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GAP</td>
<td>Gender Action Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GBV</td>
<td>Gender Based Violence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GCF</td>
<td>Green Climate Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHG</td>
<td>Greenhouse Gas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIZ</td>
<td>German Development Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GLNOB</td>
<td>Gender and Leave No One Behind</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GoI</td>
<td>Government of Indonesia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GPI</td>
<td>Gender Parity Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEAT</td>
<td>Habitat, Energy Application and Technology (HEAT GmbH)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV</td>
<td>Human Immunodeficiency Virus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IASC</td>
<td>Inter-Agency Standing Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDR</td>
<td>Indonesian Rupiah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KRL</td>
<td>Kereta Rel Listrik (commuter line)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KRPA</td>
<td>Coalition for Safe Public Space</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LNOB</td>
<td>Leave No One Behind</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LRT</td>
<td>Light Rail Transit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSS</td>
<td>Minimum Service Standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDCs</td>
<td>Nationally Determined Contributions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NYU</td>
<td>New York University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAPs</td>
<td>Project Affected Persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PIP</td>
<td>Program Indonesia Pintar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PKH</td>
<td>Program Keluarga Harapan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLN</td>
<td>Perusahaan Listrik Negara (Indonesia’s state-owned electricity company)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RPJMNN</td>
<td>Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Nasional (National Medium-Term Development Plan; Indonesia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSUD</td>
<td>Rumah Sakit Umum Daerah (Regional public hospital)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RW</td>
<td>Rukun Warga (Jakarta neighbourhood)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMA</td>
<td>Sekolah Menengah Atas (Senior high schools)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMWE</td>
<td>State Ministry for Women’s Empowerment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STEM</td>
<td>Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TA</td>
<td>Technical Assistance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TJ</td>
<td>TransJakarta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNFCCC</td>
<td>United Nations Framework on Climate Change Convention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>United Nations Children’s Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USAID</td>
<td>United States Agency for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHO</td>
<td>World Health Organization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Background

This report provides a gender and leave no one behind assessment for the “100 Electric Bus Trial Project” (or “100 E-Bus Trial Project” henceforth) in Jakarta. The Project is an operational trial of a fleet of around 100 electric buses in the network of TransJakarta (TJ). The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development identifies vulnerable groups as “women, children, youth, persons with disabilities, people living with HIV, older persons, indigenous peoples, refugees, internally displaced persons and migrants”. Women’s mobility patterns, safety needs, and representation in the transport sector differ from those of men. Other factors such as disability, income, and residential location also creates a need for services to be tailored to specific needs of such populations. It is therefore important to ensure that the 100 E-Bus Trial Project benefits all segments of society.

In Indonesia, evidence reveals that women typically show a much higher dependence on public transport while the increase in private motorized transport remains a male phenomenon. Safety and security in public transport are also crucial issues, which disproportionately affect women. A survey of 62,000 individuals across Indonesia, by the Coalition for Safe Public Space (KRPA) revealed that women were 13 times more vulnerable to sexual harassment in public transport than men. Most of the female respondents said buses (35.45%) and Angkot or public minibuses (30%) were the means of transportation where most sexual harassment took place. The gender employment gap in transport is representative of the larger gender gap in female labour force participation in Indonesia. For the last twenty years, women’s labour force participation has remained stagnant at around 52%. This is compared to 82% for men during the same time period.

Furthermore, commuting times in Indonesian cities, especially for the poor and those dependent on public transport, is high compared to peer cities and urban congestion may be constraining vulnerable populations from access to key public services. High severance and an uncertain minimum wage negotiation process have also incentivized more informality in the Indonesian labour market, and the transport sector alike, such that bus operators might be less likely to employ workers formally and relying on intermediary firms that provide outsourced workers.

Emerging Findings

The findings below reflect results from an assessment of TransJakarta services, using primary and secondary analysis, and take four dimensions into account: (i) infrastructure, its accessibility and safety impact; (ii) affordability of service; (iii) awareness and training on safety concerns; and (iv) representation in decision making and operating the service.

1 UN SDG’s.
(i) Infrastructure

The assessment found that TransJakarta and its operating partners are already increasing service accessibility to women and vulnerable populations. The Minimum Service Standards (MSS) ensure buses have wheelchair access (though not all) and priority seating for elderly, pregnant women, and disabled groups; drivers follow speed regulations and stop at designated locations; and transit infrastructure is safe for women and accessible for disabled population. Buses contain equipment to enable disability inclusiveness and prevent gender-based harassment, for example, with the use of CCTVs, announcements, and route information.

However, the full implementation of these measures are yet to be measured through a full-scale user survey as it is not clear to what extent they have been effective on the ground. In terms of infrastructure, one measure put in place in 2014 to protect female drivers themselves is the installation of a separator between the passenger and driver to reduce the risk of harassment and to prevent passengers potentially distracting the drivers4.

(ii) Affordability

In general, all transport modes charge a very affordable flat rate per trip, which is 3,500 rupiah, around 30 US cents. In addition, free ridership for 14 categories of marginalized groups is offered. Buses were integrated with micro buses in 2018, and with the MRT in 2019, using a single (one time) tapping payment system that connects different vehicles. This should significantly reduce costs from an earlier scenario of having to pay each time a vehicle change occurred (although estimates are to be verified with a rigorous evaluation).

(iii) Training

Gender harassment mitigation measures have reportedly been increasing recently (reporting information, fare information, route announcements). Some other measures include providing sexual harassment training modules as part of general operator training.

However, according to the interview with female drivers, the training for bus drivers at TransJakarta is gender neutral and does not highlight gender aspects specifically. Furthermore, female drivers showed varied understanding of reporting mechanisms and follow-up actions to be taken in the event of harassment or other unsafe occurrences. Responses on such actions ranged from “one should go to the security officers that are present in every shelter” to “contact customer complaint hotlines to which customer can report inconvenient experiences” as well as “issues should be dealt with on the spot”5.

4 Information on the number of buses with separators between drivers and passengers is not presently available.
5 Source: Interview with female bus drivers January/February 2021.
(iv) Representation and Recruitment

TransJakarta has already been promoting female driver recruitment on the basis of quotas of 30% representation. Beyond, the 100 E-Bus Trial Project, TransJakarta can also increase women’s representation in service provision and transport planning.

The gaps described above also form the context for evaluating the project’s possible risks on project-affected persons. It is expected that the risks are fairly limited initially, as the 100 E-Bus Trial Project is part of a gradual transition to an electric charging system of buses, using the existing transit stops and routes. However, key risks and resultant mitigation measures include making E-Buses more useful and user friendly by vulnerable groups like the elderly, pregnant women, children, and people with disabilities, by ensuring that E-Bus infrastructure, transit infrastructure and charging stations are accessible; that measures are taken to mitigate gender violence risks; and that services are continually affordable.

Based on these emerging findings, inputs were provided to the Business Case for the 100 E-Bus Trial. The following recommendations are also provided as part of a tentative Gender Action Plan.

Short term measures within the scope of 100 E-Bus Trial project

- Carry out a workshop/webinar to introduce the Gender Action Plan.

- Ensure that the design of infrastructure (buses, shelters, charging stations) is inclusive for people with disabilities and for women, keeping. Features that create or guarantee safety/accessibility include disability seating, wheelchair space, security cameras, route announcements and fare information, well-lit areas, at level crossing, pedestrian bridges, and elevator facilities. It is crucial that the city along with, DKI Jakarta Public Works Agency, the agency that control the pedestrian facilities of TransJakarta, make accessibility a priority to improve TransJakarta’s service to its passengers\(^6\). Furthermore, getting an assured seat and having mechanisms to report distress institute a sense of increased personal safety. As mentioned in the Business Case, it should be ensured that buses planned for procurement and charging stations contain these universal access features.

- Ensure that the affordability aspects of the integrated system are continued in the new e-bus system. Decisions to make E-Buses part of Jaklingko should be made with adequate assessment of how it impacts financially on consumers, especially poorer beneficiaries. If the tariffs are increased, the current subsidized population must be exempt from additional charges. The Single Tapping Payment system should be retained to the extent possible.

---

\(^6\) [https://www.itdp.org/2019/07/15/transjakarta-study-success/](https://www.itdp.org/2019/07/15/transjakarta-study-success/)
• Use **awareness and training to improve safety and GBV response** and prevention through trainings and safety equipment inside buses and in transit areas. Improving safety entails proper training for drivers to have full knowledge of responses and courses of action in case of harassment occurrence. Transjakarta has a 24 call center for complaints and information services, each shelter also has a complaints box. Besides this, complaints can be reported to an officer on the bus or security at the shelter. However, procedures should be adequately implemented as both customers and drivers/shelter staff are not always aware of procedures. Trans Jakarta can also ensure that any contractor and subcontractor firms hired have zero tolerance of sexual misconduct and GBV in their employment.

**Medium to longer term measures beyond the 100 E-Bus Trial project**

• **Technologies and social media campaigns can be harnessed to help prepare young migrant workers for living, working and travelling in a new city.** For example, Pulse Lab Jakarta has designed a “Know Your City App” – an application designed for new migrant workers, allowing them to digitally document places they visit and their experiences as a way to familiarize themselves with a new city. Furthermore, efforts can be placed to equip bus drivers with a unique digital identification as part of the accountability mechanism and passengers can offer feedback on grading. With a digital system in place to assess such grading, drivers can be rewarded or reprimanded for following or not adhering to the standard operating procedures.

• Improve gender balanced **recruitment** and diversity **representation** among TransJakarta planners and engineers and female bus drivers. This can be done using improved recruitment, retention and promotion methods as described in detail in Annex 4. In implementing these measures, stakeholders can also use awareness training and capacity building interventions, communications and learning materials, and using social and other forms of visual and audio means which could provide strategic openings for women.

• Gender and LNOB **representation** can also be addressed through more upstream areas such as in decision making and board rooms, and through such as improved linkages with vocational training centres, schools, and universities. In particular to join efforts with “inclusive STEM” activities for improving women’s entry into transport and engineering. To compliment such efforts, the importance of gender and leaving no one behind can be brought up during the high-level meetings with city leaders where possible.

• **TransJakarta can initiate efforts alone or in partnership with civil society organizations** to push through regulation that recognizes sexual harassment in public transport. Currently, the lack of regulation most seriously hampers authorities in dealing with sexual harassment on public transportation when the harassment occurs. Thus, each public transportation management such as TransJakarta has its own standard operational procedures about what to do
when it happens, but when they do handle it and report it to the police the police do not know what sanctions to impose or how to deal with it because there is no regulation⁷.

- Improve **data collection** efforts on the transport and mobility use and needs of women and vulnerable groups and how they might differ from men. Lack of data on gender differences and vulnerability affected persons in the transport sector in Indonesia is part of a general data gap in relation to gender and excluded persons along most SDG indicators⁸. Recently, some countries have started using big data, and participatory data to collect such information, by combining a wide range of data sources, including commercial sources of call detail records, and high-resolution satellite data, to see whether there is mobility inequality from a gender perspective⁹. The implementation of such data efforts in Indonesia would substantially improve the gender specific indicators needed to carry out baseline trends and establish reliable and timely indicators to better understand women and vulnerable groups urban mobility needs.

---

⁸ UN Women, 2019.
⁹ UN Women, 2019.
1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

In 1999, an iconic study from Vienna, Austria, asked residents of the city how often and why they used public transportation. Most of the men filled out the questionnaire in less than five minutes. But the women couldn't stop writing10. The majority of men reported using either a car or public transit twice a day – to go to work in the morning and come home at night. Women, on the other hand, used the city's network of sidewalks, bus routes, subway lines and streetcars more frequently and for a myriad of reasons. This decision to look at how men and women used public transit was part of taking gender and vulnerability into account from policy perspective. Today, in the developing world – in countries like Indonesia – this reality of a differential pattern of transport and differing access and needs between men, women, and marginalized groups, is imperative to take into account in transport planning and policy making.

As highlighted with the onset of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, marginalized groups continue to be left behind in accessing public services and infrastructure. Women and girls, people in rural areas, indigenous peoples, ethnic and linguistic minorities, people with disabilities, migrants, gender and sexual minorities, youth and older persons are disproportionately among the left behind11. These groups continue to live in multidimensional poverty or below other minimally accepted standards of security, income, and well-being12.

In Indonesia, social inclusion and gender equity continues to progress unevenly. Women make up 137 million out of its 273 million population13. As measured by international indices, Indonesia has a Gender Inequality Index value of 0.500, ranking it at 103 out of 149 countries in the United Nations Development Program 2013 index. Notable improvements have occurred in education and health14. However, improvements in human development have not translated into female employment, which remains stagnant at 52% for the last 20 years15. Estimates from McKinsey also show that Indonesia could add $135 billion, or 9%, to its annual gross domestic product, if it advances gender equality16.

Uneven urbanization in Jakarta has created possible pockets of exclusion from public services. More than 1 million poor people, and a further 15.8% of Jakartans –
or 4.7 million people – are vulnerable to falling back into poverty\textsuperscript{17}. Though many Jakartans have attained economic security comprising of a middle class of 42.1\% of the capital’s population, there are still those without access to basic services, those that live in slums, and pockets of poverty in North and West Jakarta\textsuperscript{18}. In line with WHO calculation, it is estimated that 10\% of Indonesian population (some 24 million) are people with disabilities\textsuperscript{19}. To capitalize on the possibilities of urbanization for women and the vulnerable most likely to be left behind, Indonesia should develop an inclusive strategy for urban mobility\textsuperscript{20}.

\section*{1.2 Objective}

The objective of this report is to assist with developing a gender responsive and socially inclusive project design and implementation of the “100 Electric Bus Trial Project” (or “100 E-Bus Trial Project” henceforth) in Jakarta. The Project is the implementation of an operational trial fleet of e-buses in the network of TransJakarta (TJ), as a transition to a climate efficient system of urban transportation. In line with the Government of Indonesia’s Medium-Term Development Plan 2015–2019 (RPJMN 2015–2019), the City Government intends to completely ‘electrify’ commercial vehicles used for public transport in Jakarta to reduce GHG emissions. The report proposes mitigation strategies of the project’s possible unintended negative impacts, and proposes to harness the positive impacts, on gender equality and inclusion of those left behind.

\section*{1.3 Methodology}

\subsection*{1.3.1 Introduction}

To carry out the gender and LNOB assessment in the context of the 100 E-Bus Trial Project implementation, the report follows the GIZ and GCF guidelines\textsuperscript{21} on identification of risks and mitigation strategies.

The stages to mainstream gender as outlined in Figure 1 below (activities 1-5 inclusive) at the preparatory stage, were followed.

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{17} Although poverty has continued to decline, reaching 9.4\% in March 2019 the share of Indonesians vulnerable to falling into poverty (defined as those consuming between 1 and 1.5 times the poverty line) is 20\% in 2018 or 53.3 million Indonesians. Income inequality, as measured by the Gini coefficient, at 38.2 points in March 2019 (World Bank 2020).
\item \textsuperscript{18} See Annex 3 for a breakdown of poverty rates within Greater Jakarta (Suryahadi and Marlina 2018).
\item \textsuperscript{19} World Bank 2019.
\item \textsuperscript{20} In 2019, over half of the population (about 151 million people) lived in urban areas. By 2045, more than 70\% its population is predicted to be urban (World Bank 2019).
\item \textsuperscript{21} GIZ 2019.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
The Gender and LNOB report focus solely on the Preparatory Phase (Blocks 1-5 inclusive) and suggests a tentative Gender Action Plan (Block 6).

The approach included the following activities:

1.3.2 Literature Review

Academic literature and policy reports were reviewed, comprising current publications on gender, disability, and inclusion dimensions of urban transport and climate change. Reports included the GIZ and GCF guidelines for gender mainstreaming, reports from donor partners, civil society, and the Government of Indonesia’s relevant departments, and previous Gender Assessments from GCF projects.

1.3.3 Consultations

In-country consultations were made with project related partner organizations such as TransJakarta staff and GIZ project staff members, examining the organizational, institutional, and corporate environment in which transport projects are situated.

In the areas where information gaps were found after the secondary research, various interviews were carried out to fill gaps as well as to verify information. One set of interviews was carried out with 10 female bus drivers of the TransJakarta bus service. Female bus drivers operate a range of bus types, including “single maxi” and “double-deckers” as well as “tourism” and “BRT” buses. The interviewees were female bus drivers directly hired by TransJakarta and not by its subsidiary operators.

---

22 Although further interviews were planned with a limited number of female bus riders as well, the COVID pandemic situation forestalled these
A second set of interviews was carried out with TransJakarta staff over the course of several meetings. Representatives included those from planning, operations, procurement, training and capacity building and data management and monitoring. Annex 5 provides details on consultations with both female bus drivers and TransJakarta personnel, as well as with other gender Consultants.

1.3.4 Reporting

Following the steps outlined above, this summary report has been prepared.

1.4 Structure of the Report

Following these guidelines, the report provides both a general and a transport sector specific overview on the state of gender and social equality in Indonesia, to cover both direct and indirect factors which can impact the implementation of the project, and then applies these to the particular case of TransJakarta operations. The rest of this report is organized in the following manner:

Chapter 2 describes the relationship between gender, urban mobility, and transport systems, building on global literature. It is used as a framework to think through the mechanisms and channels of impact on how transport impacts gender/vulnerability outcomes and vice versa. The second part of the chapter then addresses the particular context of Indonesia, describing current gender relations/vulnerable populations and their access to and usage of transport. Related to this discussion, Annex 1 provides a description of the policy and regulatory framework used to tackle gender equity and the social protection policies.

Chapter 3 narrows the focus on the particular case of TransJakarta and the services that it is providing to ensure women’s and vulnerable populations’ needs are taken into account. Section 3.1. and 3.2 detail existing policies and practices that are gender and LNOB focused. Section 3.3 then draws on interviews with drivers and TJ representatives to elaborate on the current gaps in the implementation of these policies and the scope of activities that can be undertaken as part of the 100 E-Bus Trial project to address these gaps. The analysis is divided into assessment of the following: the current infrastructure and how it impacts accessibility/usage and safety, the affordability of the service, current efforts at awareness raising and training to address sexual harassment and other safety concerns, and the representation and recruitment of women and disadvantaged groups in TransJakarta planning and delivery systems. Annex 6 detailed results of interviews with female bus drivers that detail their specific concerns from a gender perspective.

Together these form the basis for assessing the 100 E-Bus Trial’s risks and mitigation strategies – which are summarized in Chapter 4 of this report.

Chapter 5 concludes with a summary of emerging findings. This could be refined more precisely, with provision of results indicators, and implementing agency responsibilities, during the design and implementation phase. A tentative Gender Action Plan is presented in Annex 4.
2. GENDER AND VULNERABILITY IN THE URBAN TRANSPORT SECTOR

2.1 The Linkages Between Gender/Social Exclusion and Transport Systems: The Global Context

Transport plays a key role in enabling access to basic needs and services such as water, food, household goods, health, education and economic resources. As such, transport systems inherently reflect and reinforce social inequalities. In general, transport works better for heterosexual, able-bodied, men than they do for women, girls, sexual and gender minorities, and people with disabilities.

Most planning systems were developed in the industrialized North over the course of the 20th century and which were biased in favour of individual journey-to-work trips. Households were assumed to be consisting of a male ‘breadwinner’ with primary responsibility for the ‘productive’ tasks, a female ‘home-maker’ with primary responsibility for the ‘reproductive’ caretaking tasks; and the same needs and mobility solutions, regardless of physical/mental condition and socio-economic status. These planning systems were then also inappropriately exported to developing countries. Today, the problematic nature of these underlying assumptions is better understood. A growing body of knowledge has documented that travel patterns and transport infrastructure needs differ between men and women, and other diverse groups.

Studies from around the world show that women depend more on public transport than men, especially when they are part of the lower income strata. In France, two-thirds of public transit passengers are women. In the United States in 2007, 55% of public transit passengers were women. In Germany, women use public transport more than men.

Women are more likely to engage in “trip chaining,” where trips are short, multimodal and frequent, because they have to manage care and household work and formal employment. One study from Bhopal, India, shows that more than

24 Ibid.
25 Ibid.
26 Theorists began to analyse the ways in which planning, and design had excluded the needs of women and the marginalized. In response to these theoretical developments, cities such as Toronto and Vienna led the way in incorporating gender considerations into their planning and design processes during the 1980’s and 1990’s. Important projects such as the Frauen-Werk-Stadt (Women-Work-City) development in Vienna (completed in 1997) and the Women in Safe Environments (WISE) report in Toronto (1987) explored how urban planning and design can help ease the burden of caregiving for women and promote their safety in the public realm. (World Bank 2020).
27 Buehler R and J Pucher, 2012. Along with discussing motorized transport, it is important to note that available evidence world-wide shows that a significantly higher share of women than men do not have access to any means of transport. Hence, women are dependent on walking. This is due to both economic and social reasons. There is now also rich literature documenting the immense struggle women in developing countries face in accessing health care and basic services, as well as livelihood means, such as delivering their produce and goods to local markets because of the lack of transport (Buehler R and J Pucher, 2012).
30% of women travel with dependents, as opposed to less than 16% of men. Women's travel patterns are more complex - from schools to places of work to shopping, health care, and recreational facilities or places of worship. Men, however, still tend to make longer yet more direct commuting trips to and from work twice a day. A report 'Women in Transit' by the Women's Foundation of California found that low-income African American women with children take five times more trips by public transit than the general female population and six times more trips than men. Another study from India similarly revealed that more than 50% of the 2000-odd women interviewed undertake chained trips, which requires women to juggle different tasks.

As a result of being overburdened by these tasks, women are more starved for time – a phenomenon known as time poverty while paying more for transport. A recent study of two New York subway lines “The Pink Tax in Transport” showed how women can pay up to USD 50 more than men because their needs are different. Local, flexible, off peak transit operations are therefore typically more important to women, the elderly, and youth, than men.

Due to time poverty, related to poor transport design, women's employment opportunities are also heavily impacted. According to the International Labour Organization, limited access, and lack of safe transport is the greatest obstacle to women's labour market participation, reducing their probability of involvement by up to 16.5%age points. Alternatively, they tend to seek employment opportunities closer to home with more flexible hours. This translates into a higher sensitivity to distance. In the US, poor women in particular continue to encounter a 'spatial mismatch' between the location of their place of residence, located in less desirable low-income areas near the centre, and possible places of employment, i.e. low-skilled service sector jobs in suburban areas with poor transit access. The crucial question in all settings is how accessible places of employment are for both men and women.

In the current model, problems are created by lack of diversity in decision-making circles and among operators. Even the most sophisticated technology cannot solve problems that were not considered. Bus drivers and train conductors across the world are predominantly male. Given that the same challenges (for example, likelihood to travel off-peak and along lower capacity routes, and more often travel encumbered with children or groceries) are not immediately present in their own daily routines, those (men) who plan and implement public transit services typically do not pay adequate attention to issues most important to women. Agencies may have a general interest in providing adequate service to all customers, but unless a specific effort is constantly made to ask both men and women what they need and want and how services can be improved, sub-optimal solutions persist. As a result, bus shelters could lack basic safety and comfort features (lighting, benches, emergency call

28 World Resources Institute 2015.
29 Quoted in ibid. p9.
30 Ibid.
31 ITF, 2019.
34 Peters, 2013.
options) built-in barriers where barrier-free access could have easily been provided, etc.

In 2013, in an effort to create a more equitable public transportation system, Transport for London (TfL) undertook an initiative focusing on gender gaps in five categories: accessibility, safety and security, affordability, information, and employment. Through speaking with 140 different women’s groups, TfL drafted an action plan and a four-year initiative called Action on Equality. The initiative took forward suggestions such as accessible bus stops, more legible maps, improved lighting at bus stops, a diverse transportation workforce, priority seating for women and the elderly, and real-time schedule information on buses\(^\text{35}\).

### 2.2 Gender and Vulnerability in the Transport Sector: The Indonesian Context

In Indonesia similarly, evidence reveals that women typically show a much higher dependence on public transport while the increase in private motorized transport remains a male phenomenon. An increase from 8.5% to 10.5% in private transport such as cars and motorbikes were evidenced in 2017, and a motorization rate of 488 per 1,000 people in 2017\(^\text{36}\). This is related to women’s lower power in the household and the tendency of male members of households to appropriate private means of transport\(^\text{37}\). Thus, Indonesia’s low transport infrastructure performance and capacity (Indonesia ranked only 63rd in the 2016 Logistics Performance Index) disproportionately affects women as a group reliant on the public good nature of it.

Evidence suggests that commuting times in Indonesian cities, especially for the poor and those dependent on public transport, is high compared to peer cities. Given the limited NMT infrastructure and slow traffic speed not only during peak periods but also throughout the day\(^\text{38}\), and because they are dependent on public transport, women and vulnerable groups are disadvantaged in their access to jobs, places, activities and services. Traffic speeds are slow, not only in peak periods but also throughout the day, and especially for public transport vehicles, with a daily average of between 23 and 28 km/h\(^\text{39}\).

Reports reveal that urban congestion may be constraining vulnerable populations from access to key public services, such as transport, in Jakarta. A World Bank estimate of the times and costs associated with reaching health and education facilities reveal a high level of spatial inequality. For example, “data taken from Google Maps and Trafi show that it takes residents of an average Jakarta neighbourhood (Rukun Warga, RW) around 40 minutes to reach a regional public hospital (Rumah Sakit Umum Daerah, RSUD) using only public transport, but that for

---

37 Peters, 2013.
38 Ibid.
some neighbourhoods, the travel time is almost 2 hours”\textsuperscript{40}. Similarly, it costs Jakartans IDR 4,000 to reach a health facility at the median, but this rises to IDR 20,000 for some neighbourhoods. Accessing the three top-ranked senior high schools (Sekolah Menengah Atas, SMA) in each Kota takes 107 minutes and costs 16,000 IDR for some Jakarta residents, despite taking just 35 minutes and IDR 3,500 for the median neighbourhood. Therefore, urban populations run the risk of being left behind if services are not tailored with spatial, income, and other inequalities in mind as well as specific conditions and needs – for example of women or disabled persons – that differ from the needs of the average population.

\textbf{The gender employment gap in transport is representative of the larger gender gap in female labour force participation in Indonesia.} For the last twenty years, women’s labour force participation has remained stagnant at around 52%. This is compared to 82% for men during the same time period\textsuperscript{34}. In transport, men make up 5% of the total number of employed men, compared to less than 1% of women\textsuperscript{41}. As a representative example from a related industry, there are only 120 women among Blue bird taxi group’s 40,000 taxi drivers. According to Noni Sri Ayati Purnomo, president director of the Blue Bird Group, the common perception that it is not socially acceptable and unsafe for women to drive taxis which disadvantages women\textsuperscript{42}. Similar biases operate in mass transit subsector, though gender quotas among bus operators have recently been instituted to improve women’s representation\textsuperscript{43}. Predominantly, it is social norms and the traditional division of labour that keeps women from the labour market. Marriage and having children has a profound effect on women’s participation in the labour force – 42% of women working in formal sector employment are not working at all one year after marriage\textsuperscript{44}.

\textbf{High severance and an uncertain minimum wage negotiation process have also incentivized more informality in the Indonesian labour market, and the transport sector alike}\textsuperscript{45}. Private operators might be less likely to employ workers formally as a strategy to cut costs, and most companies respond by not using formal contracts, resorting instead to short-term contracts or relying on intermediary firms that provide outsourced workers. In fact, around one third of all Indonesian employees are still working without a contract\textsuperscript{46}. Informality hinders their legal recognition and access to social protection as well as wage equality. Indonesian women have a 24% higher probability of working in the informal sector than men. Women also earn less than 80% of the male wage. Of this, 62% of the gap in formal sector wages, and 75% of the gap in informal wages are “unexplained” i.e. due largely to discrimination. Finally, lack of quality, affordable childcare has also been shown to have a significant impact on women’s employment, especially in urban Indonesia\textsuperscript{47}.

\textsuperscript{40} World Bank 2019.
\textsuperscript{41} https://jakartaglobe.id/business/women-seek-greater-role-in-indonesias-transportation-industry/
\textsuperscript{42} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{43} TransJakarta consultation, April 2020.
\textsuperscript{44} Schaner and Theys, 2020.
\textsuperscript{45} World Bank, 2019.
\textsuperscript{46} World Bank, 2016.
\textsuperscript{47} Schaner and Theys, 2020.
2.3 Spotlight Issue – Women’s and Marginalized People’s Safety & Gender-Based Violence

Safety and security in public transport are crucial issues, which disproportionately affect women. A survey of 62,000 individuals across Indonesia, by the Coalition for Safe Public Space (KRPA) revealed that women were 13 times more vulnerable to sexual harassment in public transport than men. Most of the female respondents said buses (35.45%) and Angkot or public minibuses (30%) were the means of transportation where most sexual harassment took place.

This is part of a growing recognition of high rates of violence against women in Indonesia. According to the first countrywide survey by the National Commission on Violence Against Women, in 2016, one in three women aged 15-64 had experienced gender-based violence in her lifetime. Of the cases, 27% of cases occurred in public spaces. However, the rising trend must be interpreted in light of an increase in reporting of a phenomenon that had existed from earlier.

An UNWomen safety audit in Jakarta similarly revealed that women are vulnerable to verbal and physical harassment in public transport and the risk of these encounters tends to increase during evening hours. Women actively cope by travelling more off-peak hours, preserving anonymity and being low-key, becoming familiar with a travel route, and building companionship with other commuters. Insufficient street-lighting, hazardous walkways and absence of security posts typically limited women’s mobility and travel choices at night. Women rarely used the designated transit points (such as Angkot stops or halte) and prefer to wait in areas where there are activities, such as where street vendors are present.

Women’s safety is a concern also where access to the transport is crowded or constrained and results not only in preferential boarding practices for men but also harassment opportunity. According to a group of women surveyed for a study in Hyderabad, women felt most vulnerable to theft or harassment on access routes and boarding points of buses.

When harassment happens, the impact is not restricted to their use of public transport facilities. The impact is amplified because it directly affects their access to economic, social and health opportunities, given the role of transport in providing access. High instances of maternal mortality due to pregnancy-related complications are closely linked to poor women’s non-access to reliable, on-demand motorized

50 Schaner and Theys, 2020.
51 As part of the UN Women’s Safe Cities and Safe Public Spaces Global Initiative, in 2017 UN Women in Indonesia conducted a safety audit in Jakarta.
52 World Resource Institute, 2015.
transport. The unavailability of safe transport also seriously impacts girls’ educational possibilities, as parents will keep them away from school if transit is unsafe.

Recent studies have also shown the correlation between violence against women and labour force participation. A survey of non-working women in Delhi showed that ‘lack of safety’ was one of the biggest reasons for their decision to not enter the formal workforce. Another report by Chakraborty et al in 2014 stated that women would be less likely to participate in the labour force when perceived threat of crime against them is high, and this deterrent effect is likely to be stronger in traditional societies.

Currently, women do not have full legal protection from gender-based violence. Although gender equality is enshrined in the constitution through general provisions for equal rights before the law, and the country has ratified the Convention on the Elimination of Violence Against Women and Law No. 39 on Human Rights of 1999 that guarantees women effective protection against any act of discrimination, large loopholes remain. Studies highlight the lack of legislation, civil remedies or criminal penalties to protect against sexual harassment, and domestic-violence legislation for unmarried partners. The Draft Bill on the Elimination of Sexual Violence was set to fill the gap, with an expanded definition of sexual violence and a focus on protection and victim restitution. Unfortunately, the draft bill was not passed in the last parliamentary sitting. It is notable that the bill is still included in this year’s priority list of the national legislation program. There also seems to be growing support from civil society groups for the bill.

Though reporting may have increased in general, studies still point to the lack of proper reporting systems and women’s lack of faith in them. Women respondent in the UNWomen study knew of call centres and helplines through social network and saw advertisements, however none of the respondents expressed a willingness to file a report. More than shame or fear of their identity being revealed, they had doubts about whether there will be follow up action from the authorities.

53 Ibid.
54 World Resources Institute, 2015.
57 UNWomen, 2017.
58 UNWomen, 2017.
3. EMERGING FINDINGS: GENDER AND MARGINALITY PROVISIONS AND GAPS IN THE TRANSJAKARTA SYSTEM

3.1 Methodology

The following discussion in Chapter 3 is based upon a combination of literature review and in-depth interviews carried out with 5 female drivers working in TransJakarta. *Section 3.2 (on existing provisions)* is based on secondary desk review as the goal was to capture existing policies, regulations, and provisions made by TransJakarta on the extent to which gender and LNOB needs are taken into account in their planning, service management, and within their human resource systems.

*Section 3.3 (on gaps in implementation)* then builds largely on in-depth interviews carried out by the Consultant Team. A total of 5 in-depth interviews were conducted with female bus drivers. The goal was to further verify information gathered from the secondary sources and learn from the drivers experiences and knowledge – of current gender and LNOB friendly policies and challenges/gaps in their implementation – for example, minimum standards, GBV prevention and training, female driver’s experience of TransJakarta as workplace.

The Team also spoke with TransJakarta staff from various relevant departments about their experience of gender and LNOB policies and implementation, and current views on areas of improvement. A list of all consultations carried out is provided in Annex 5.

3.2 Existing TransJakarta Provisions for Women and Marginalized Populations

TransJakarta has the world’s longest BRT system (251.2 km in length), which operates about 3,900 buses. As of February 2020, it serves an average of 1,006 million passengers daily\(^59\). TransJakarta has a total of 155 routes as of January 2019 (corridor, cross route, and feeder route), a significant increase from 41 in 2015. The number of TransJakarta buses has also increased dramatically, from 605 buses in 2015 to 3,581 in 2020\(^60\). The busiest time for TransJakarta operation is between 6-9 am and 5-8pm. This suggests most of the customers use buses for work purposes\(^61\).

---

59 The Jakarta Post, 5 February 2020.
60 The Jakarta Post, 2017.
Evidence so far shows that TransJakarta and its operating partners are working towards increasing access of women and marginalized populations’ to their services. First, the emphasis on expansion of services to new parts of the city of Jakarta has benefited women and vulnerable populations. The network has moved from few routes to more direct/feeder routes and systems, moving to inner streets and peripheral areas of the city. Survey data on users so far shows high female usage rates, with the following gender disaggregation:

- BRT: 48% Female, 52% Male
- Non-BRT: 52% Female, 48% Male
- Microtrans: 40% Female, 60% Male

---

3.2.1 Infrastructure

**Regulatory requirements for Bus Infrastructure Disability Access** includes the following: Regarding people with disabilities, Law No.25/2009 on Public Services (2009): Article 29 requires public service providers to provide special treatment to persons with disabilities in accordance with regulations. Law No. 4/1997 on Persons with Disabilities and Government Regulation 43/1998 on Efforts to improve the Social Welfare of Persons with Disabilities (1997/1998) establishes a quota of 1% for the employment of persons with disabilities in the public and private sector; states that “every disabled person has equal rights and opportunities in all aspects of life”; and lists various rights accorded to persons with disabilities such as education, employment, equal treatment, accessibility, rehabilitation.

Another major pro-poor change in the TransJakarta system was the introduction of the “low entry” bus (also known as the Metrotrans) in 2017 as part of the non-BRT fleet. Today, 289 Metrotrans operate in the system. A game changer, the low floors of these vehicles increase accessibility to wheelchairs and for people with difficulty climbing on to higher platforms, as it matches pedestrian sidewalks. The Metrotrans are also inclusive spatially as they serve smaller/narrower inner-city lanes off the main road, and more peripheral areas, not served by the BRTs. The newer fleet of buses is also designed to be wheelchair accessible (Figure 3).

---

63 Bus Rapid Transit.
The fact that each TransJakarta vehicle is equipped with special designated areas for elderly, pregnant women, and disabled people as well as spaces for women to sit to avoid harassment also shows that efforts towards gender responsiveness is increasing. Furthermore, lighting in bus stops, functioning lighting inside the buses are part of the service standard. A special wheelchair park space inside buses is mandated but only in BRT systems. Feeder buses do not have wheelchair space currently. Furthermore, while the capacity of each bus varies from 85, 100 to 120 passengers – actual user practices and whether there are load limit regulations matter for the safety of women and disabled/vulnerable populations.

Other features that have added to TransJakarta’s reliability and gender/disability sensitivity include regulation on headway (five minutes during rush hour/10 minutes for non-rush hours/60 seconds wait in bus stops); dedicated bus lanes, and off-board fare purchasing. According to reports, enforcing specific stops has also created a cultural shift for riders, and drivers, who were accustomed to boarding or picking up passengers at any moment along the route. Designated stops has reduced commotion and risks for women, elderly and disabled and thus made service experience more orderly and safer. With the increased regulation, passengers have seemed adapted to new features like having to purchase tickets in advance which adds to women’s safety as there is no last-minute rush and crowded spaces of people forcing themselves into moving vehicles – a scenario common in many middle-income developing countries.

Buses also equipped with various surveillance and disability friendly equipment that makes it easier to use the service. It also addresses risks of sexual harassment. The equipment of each bus with an electronic board and speakers that announce the name of shelters and a bi-directional radio transceiver in each bus to allow the driver to provide and receive updated information regarding traffic jams, road accidents or lost items, all help in increasing the safety of women, and making the

64 Regulation 13/2019 on Minimum Service Standard.
service more accessible to disabled populations. Stop announcements help women commuters hearing and visually impaired computers and computers who may be unfamiliar with the route. A mobile application that is available for free to all passengers, giving them access to departure and arrival times also helps women plan and decide routes in advance – an important element of women’s sense of security through predictability as documented in global evidence from women’s testimonials on coping with harassment65.

To address risks related to gender-based violence, in August 2011, TransJakarta operator installed cameras for a trial period in the newer fleets. According to reports, the plan is to install four cameras on each bus gradually in efforts to improve services such as to inform passengers waiting for buses about how crowded approaching buses are, and to prevent sexual harassment66. Cameras are currently a mandatory facility for new buses.

The small and medium bus operators integrated with TransJakarta now follow the TransJakarta Minimum Service Standards (MSS). The MSS policy still prohibits smoking on board and requires that drivers follow speed regulations (max 50 km/hr.) and stop at designated locations, which benefits women and people with special needs67. Other safety clauses include mandating drivers to be in uniforms and display IDs. These rules are enforced through fines and are successful in limiting or diminishing such problematic behaviour. However, TransJakarta works with partnerships with private operators who operate around 75% of the fleet. TransJakarta directly operates only 25% of fleet. Operators are private companies and many run as cooperatives (some of them large as having 5,000 members). Thus, only a portion of their members has a contract with TransJakarta. This makes it harder to regulate as informality increases among operators with individualized contracts.

3.2.2 Affordability

All transport modes charge a flat rate of 3,500 rupiah, around 30 cents per trip, which is itself very affordable. However, there are free services for 14 categories of marginalized groups, accounting for around 30% of users. These make up a significant amount of passengers. The target groups consist of people with disabilities, veterans, and those receiving other forms of social security. The majority of these groups uses micro buses.

Another pro-poor policy includes the integration with different modes of transport, which is especially beneficial to women given their trip chaining needs. Buses were integrated with micro buses in 2018, and with the MRT in 2019, using a single (one time) tapping payment system that connects different vehicles. This should significantly reduce costs from an earlier scenario of having to pay each time a vehicle change occurred (although estimates are to be verified with a rigorous evaluation). The newest integration is with the Microtrans, or the smaller buses.

65 ITDP, 2019.
66 ITDP, 2019.
especially targeted towards people who live in settlement areas. They are also much
closer to people’s homes as drop off pick-ups are much closer to houses in the smaller
roads – improving disability inclusiveness significantly. Microbuses take around 25% of
daily passengers or 234,000 people in 69 routes.

Figure 5. Metrotrans Bus with Low Floors

Source: TransJakarta Website

3.2.3 Gender & LNOB Awareness & Training

Sexual harassment awareness stickers at transit stops, with a hotline number and SMS complain handling number, have also been made mandatory since February 2019. Currently, there are a total of 5,634 bus stops, of which only 278 are covered shelters as BRT stops. A minimum of two stickers are mandated at all the bus stops, in easily visible areas. Although TransJakarta stated that this has been implemented at a 100% rate, this has not yet been verified.

3.2.4 Gender & LNOB Representation and Recruitment

In order to promote gender equity, TransJakarta has also been increasing the number of female driver recruits. The projected female bus driver proportion is 30% of total drivers; currently amounting to around 50 drivers. Starting on 21 April 2016, TransJakarta launched several new female-only buses for Corridor 1. Whilst the impact of this service has been debated in the literature, the bus is crewed by a female driver and female onboard officers and is painted pink to distinguish it from regular buses - which goes some way to mitigate harassment.

69 Interview with Pak Hardi, designation, TransJakarta.
3.3 Gaps Related to the Inclusion of Women and Marginalized Populations in the TransJakarta System

3.3.1 Infrastructure

First, the Team found that few data and information in TransJakarta are disaggregated by gender. Information on the extent to which minimum standards in infrastructure provision are adhered to, or the level of gender and disability-based capacity building and training, does not yet exist. With the majority of bus stops constructed without shelters, safety protocols seem hard to follow. Disability inclusion is also limited as only BRT stops have wheelchair access provided.

Monitoring and regulation of contractual compliance of small-scale providers (the larger TransJakarta network) seems challenging given the decentralized nature of service provision.

As the 100 E-Bus Trial project is implemented later in 2021/2022 and once the locations of the charging stations become known, the number of affected persons by the project will become clearer. It is not expected however that there would be a large number of persons affected by the construction as this is expected to occur at terminals or depots. Regarding the E-Bus fleet; there is little difference between an E-Bus and a conventional diesel or CNG bus. In general E-Buses are a little heavier and wider. However, for the Trial the E-Bus drivers would need to be trained and this program would include the training of female E-Bus drivers. If the project design is based largely on depot charging systems, project affected persons could include those presently living near existing depots – in which case the project would have to ensure that any new facilities meet existing minimum standards for lighting and safety.

In future, the draft Gender Action plan (Annex 4) could incorporate further information on the compliance of bus operators with TJ’s policies on gender and safety measures, as well as information from female bus riders.

3.3.2 Gender & LNOB Awareness & Training

Despite the progress in sexual harassment mitigation efforts, women continue indicating difficulty reporting harassment and it appears that little has been done yet to promote specific reporting and to train staff on measures to redress grievances.

According to interviews with TransJakarta staff, there has not been any specific program related to gender and disability awareness-raising on a large or systematic scale. Interviews with female bus drivers confirmed that gaps with regard to training exist, but training by TransJakarta now includes to some extent gender and disability topics. However, it is evident that further measures could be implemented to address sexual harassment systematically, through the use of training and awareness raising. One female bus driver mentioned, “It would be great to have training on sexual harassment or gender, however until now training programs are general. There is a small section on risk in which harassment is mentioned, but it is not specifically addressed” (Interview, February 2021).
Female bus drivers understanding of how to respond to harassment and follow-up actions seemed to be varied and ad hoc. Drivers responses ranged from “the victim can instantly confront the doer, and they will be forced to get off at the next stop, at which a TransJakarta officers will act on the doer’s crime”, to “going to a security officer that is present in every shelter” and to “going to the customer complaint hotline to which customer can report any inconvenient experiences, but such cases are not reported and this is not an effective way of handling this type of crime”, and finally to “encourage the victim to speak up on the spot, so it would be easier for the doer be acted on”. The responses demonstrate the need for the design of more systematic response mechanisms to improve the effectiveness of responses to harassment. On the positive side it also shows an awareness among female bus drivers of the need for more effective responses. When responses are systematic, potential harassment can also be deterred, as shown by global evidence, since all parties are clear on risks and sanctions.

3.3.3 Gender and LNOB Representation and Recruitment

Interviews with female bus drivers revealed that TransJakarta has been promoting a gender and inclusion conscious workplace, however attitudes and practices lag behind the formal policies. Currently, TransJakarta provides listed off-time for female bus drivers, provisions for menstrual leave, 3 months of maternity leave, and unpaid leave options, if needed, to supplement maternity leave. Paternity leave is also provided, although two days. Female bus drivers described that appropriate facilities such as separate lavatories are put in place for female bus drivers, and employees are very respectful and thoughtful of women co-workers. TransJakarta also has an explicit equal-pay policy in place and female drivers even have 2 days per month for menstruation leave, which can only be taken by presenting a letter from a health facility. The uptake of this policy could not be verified in the interviews conducted.

However, the prioritization of male drivers and a predominantly male work culture was evident from the responses, although this problem goes beyond the organization to larger gender normative context. Nonetheless, interviews revealed that “female drivers rarely get the flexi-time, since TransJakarta usually prioritizes male drivers when a spare driver is needed”. Usually, male drivers were promoted as “spare” drivers instead of women, which would naturally increase their pay, as drivers are paid by the hour. “Thus, it almost never happens that female bus drivers are called upon for replacing male drivers in an emergency situation”. Furthermore, the policy related to pregnancy have been described as one where pregnant bus drivers are “not allowed to drive after 6 months of pregnancy”. Although from a do-no-harm perspective this policy might protect female drivers, who might otherwise have felt obliged to continue driving beyond this time for pay; in practice the lack of a choice for female bus drivers could mean that they could be subject to lower levels of pay as well. This is also a case in point to highlight how policies can have differential impacts on men and women. “Pay by the hour” was introduced to replaced “pay by the kilometre” in order to promote safe driving, however female bus drivers might not have benefitted from this change as much as male drivers, since they could neither put in as many hours nor the kilometres as male bus drivers could.
Female bus drivers also expressed a view that gender-related policies are somewhat ad hoc and tend to change with changes in management. ‘Until last year, every female bus driver has one day menstruation leave every month. But it’s no longer there (available)”.

In terms of recruitment, gaps exist in outreach for recruitment of female bus drivers. Although the problem starts earlier, at the level of educational choices and gender stereotypes in the transport industry, and thus prevents a larger supply of female drivers, there can still be efforts made to target female driver recruits more explicitly. Female bus drivers indicated that their entry into the organization was mostly through word-of-mouth. As studies from other countries have shown, the explicit targeting of women through improved information and outreach can improve the representation of female and marginalized groups. Female bus drivers at TransJakarta expressed the main reasons for low representation as a “norm” such as: “many women think it’s difficult to drive a bus and consider this as male work”, and that women do not apply “due to lack of confidence”. Women’s double duties, and household work burden was also expressed as a deterrent for considering bus driving as a profession.
4. 100 E-BUS TRIAL’S RISKS AND MITIGATION STRATEGIES

4.1 Introduction

As a key element of the TA support, a Business Case Assessment has been developed for the 100- E-Bus Trial. Important inputs on Gender and LNOB have formed a part of the Business Case.

4.2 Potential social impacts

A Gender and Leave No One Behind Assessment was carried out for the project, identifying the poverty, disability, and gender aspects. The project affected persons include:

- **The service beneficiaries**: of which special attention should be given to poorer household users, women, and people with disabilities. Currently, these are 48% female and 52% male users for BRT; and 52% female, 48% male riders for Non-BRT routes.
- **Other affected persons**: bus drivers chosen for training to operate E-Bus, female drivers chosen to operate the buses, charging station technicians and workers.

The project does not affect any persons/households in terms of land use changes or livelihoods changes. This is because the bus service for the 100 E-Buses remains in the existing BRT corridor (Route 6) and existing Non-BRT corridors (Route 6D and 9D). In terms of other technical works, the social footprint is minimal as there is no construction foreseen. The charging stations are proposed in the Operator’s Depot spaces and thus no new land acquisition will be required. Therefore, the social and LNOB impact of the project is minimal due to its trial nature and limited changes from current service structure.

4.3 Risk Identification and Mitigation

The following aspects should be kept in mind to avoid negative social and gender impacts and promote inclusion. Table 1 below summarizes the risks, opportunities, and the necessary measures.

70 except for day-time parking and charging for Route 6. The land requirements are under finalization.
### Table 1: Gender and ‘Leave No One Behind’: Target Groups and Their Information Needs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Risk Dimension</th>
<th>Project Affected Persons Category</th>
<th>Risk Impact Channel</th>
<th>Mitigation Strategy</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Infrastructure</strong></td>
<td>Service Beneficiaries – female</td>
<td>Infrastructure accessibility and Safety risks</td>
<td>Infrastructure accessibility measures</td>
<td>Operating team in TJ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Service Beneficiaries - differently abled persons</td>
<td>Service and bus accessibility and safety concerns</td>
<td>Infrastructure accessibility measures</td>
<td>Procurement team in TJ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Directly displaced population or Owners of houses/land/other structures.</td>
<td>Land use change</td>
<td>Consult community on their perceptions on the project and its impact as well as the mitigation measures.</td>
<td>The project does not require any land with households hence there is no need for a survey of households in project area.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Affordability</strong></td>
<td>Service Beneficiaries (all)</td>
<td>Affordability risk due to change in cost of service</td>
<td>If the tariffs are increased, the current subsidized population must be exempt from additional charges. The Single Tapping Payment system should be retained to the extent possible.</td>
<td>Financial team in TJ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Awareness &amp; Training</strong></td>
<td>Service Beneficiaries - female (also application to all customers)</td>
<td>Gender and disadvantages groups safety risks</td>
<td>Awareness raising &amp; knowledge dissemination measures; involvement in becoming vigilantes and report witnessed violence.</td>
<td>Operating team in TJ &amp; Capacity Building Team</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment &amp; Representation</td>
<td>Service Providers - Bus drivers, transit stop employees, charging station operators.</td>
<td>Gender and disadvantages groups safety risks</td>
<td>Training on response and prevention measures; Awareness raising measures.</td>
<td>Capacity Building team in TJ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Electric Bus Drivers (all)</td>
<td>Potential training opportunities during retraining for E-Bus</td>
<td>Gender and disability sensitivity training measures</td>
<td>Capacity Building team, TJ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Depot Charging Helpers/Technicians</td>
<td>Potential training opportunities during retraining for E-Bus</td>
<td>Gender and disability sensitivity training measures</td>
<td>Technical team, TJ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Indirectly affected persons – Bus: technicians and drivers</td>
<td>Income changes</td>
<td>Calculate the socio-economic profile of families likely to be impacted and develop action plan to minimize impact.</td>
<td>Project proposes to use the same technicians and drivers as previously employed under diesel fuel buses.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fuel station: workers and owners</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Consultant Team*
5. RECOMMENDATIONS

Transport is on the edge of ground-breaking changes whose benefits must be harnessed for all sections of society. Based on the findings in Chapter 3, TransJakarta has already instituted many measures to improve: infrastructure accessibility both spatially and usage wise, affordability, safety for women, elderly, and people with disabilities, and the representation and recruitment of women.

However as evidenced by interviews, several gaps exist in the implementation of these policies and regulations. In terms of infrastructure, the minimum standards compliance is unclear. In terms of safety, gender gaps exist in GBV response and trainings. And major gaps exist in recruitment and workplace gender conscious culture. Regulation is moreover complex due to the informal and decentralized nature of the transport business with several subcontractors operating TransJakarta fleet.

The move to E-Buses provides several opportunities to address these gaps. While infrastructure accessibility can be ensured, other measures might be beyond the scope of the 100 E-Bus Trial project. Nonetheless, based on the findings in Section 3, the following recommendations are provided for the roll out of E-Buses in TransJakarta.

Infrastructure

Firstly, new procurement on infrastructure means further opportunities to ensure that buses, the transit stops, and charging stations are safe and accessible. Features that create or guarantee safety/accessibility include disability seating, wheelchair space, security cameras, route announcements and fare information, well-lit areas, at level crossing, pedestrian bridges, and elevator facilities. It is crucial that the city along with, DKI Jakarta Public Works Agency, the agency that control the pedestrian facilities of TransJakarta, make accessibility a priority to improve TransJakarta’s service to its passengers. Furthermore, getting an assured seat and having mechanisms to report distress institute a sense of increased personal safety. As mentioned in the Business Case, it should be ensured that buses planned for procurement and charging stations contain these universal access features.

Affordability

Decisions to make E-Buses part of Jaklingko should be made with adequate assessment of how it impacts financially on consumers, especially poorer beneficiaries. If the tariffs are increased, the current subsidized population must be exempt from additional charges. The Single Tapping Payment system should be retained to the extent possible.

71 https://www.itdp.org/2019/07/15/transjakarta-study-success/
Awareness and Training

Improving safety entails proper training for drivers to have full knowledge of responses and courses of action in case of harassment occurrence. Responses from female bus drivers for example indicated a clear need for a more systematic harassment response training. Furthermore, efforts can be placed to equip bus drivers with a unique digital identification as part of the accountability mechanism and passengers can offer feedback on grading. With a digital system in place to assess such grading, drivers can be rewarded or reprimanded for following or not adhering to the standard operating procedures.

Furthermore, city governments can work together with local civil society groups and law enforcement to develop a guide and special trainings for interested street vendors, who can act as street wardens72.

Technologies and social media campaigns can be harnessed to help prepare young migrant workers for living, working and travelling in a new city. For example, Pulse Lab Jakarta has designed a “Know Your City App” – an application designed for new migrant workers, allowing them to digitally document places they visit and their experiences as a way to familiarize themselves with a new city. Furthermore, by kick-starting a campaign at the city level to promote knowledge sharing, new migrant workers can connect with other individuals who may be living or working in the same building or living in close proximity to each other. The goal would be to ultimately develop a companion system for group travelling73.

Gender LNOB Representation and Recruitment

There is a need to enable women’s employment in the transport sector and supporting greater recruitment of women in technical and managerial positions – by targeted hiring, vocational training, improving female experience in the workplace, improving policy and regulations. Attempts to improve gender and marginality impacts of transports means that efforts much go beyond rolling out of security apps and female recruitment campaigns or female-only carriages. It must penetrate policy making and planning whereby women’s voices are also heard inside the core business of constructing and running transport networks. This also includes special training and confidence building for female drivers and changing the work hours and payment systems to suit their needs.

The transport sector is also very much in need of a data revolution. Overall, the availability of recent data and information on gender differences and vulnerability affected persons in the transport sector in Indonesia is limited. This is part of a general data gap in relation to gender and excluded persons along most SDG indicators74. The 2017 Global Action Plan for Sustainable Development Data thus calls for a “data revolution” whereby the volume speed and types of data produced are expanded, including through support for statistical systems, and greater partnerships between

72 UNWomen, 2019.
73 UNWomen, 2019.
74 UN Women, 2019.
Government, citizens, and private sector. Recently, other countries have started using big data, and participatory data to collect such information. For example, GovLab (NYU), UNICEF and other partners\(^{75}\) are joining forces to study the intersection of urban mobility and gender in Chile. By combining a wide range of data sources, including commercial sources of call detail records, and high-resolution satellite data, the project seeks to answer – whether gender plays a role in the way people move in a city such as Santiago and if so how, and if there is mobility inequality from a gender perspective\(^{76}\). The implementation of such data efforts in Indonesia would substantially improve the gender specific indicators needed to carry out baseline trends and establish reliable and timely indicators to better understand women and vulnerable groups urban mobility needs.

**Based on the findings in Chapter 3, also reflected in the Gender Action Plan in Annex 4**, the report recommends the following measures to make the 100 E-Bus Trial project more gender and LNOB inclusive:

**Short term measures within the scope of 100 E-Bus Trial project**

4. Carry out a **workshop/webinar** to introduce the Gender Action Plan.

5. Improve **data collection** efforts on the transport and mobility use and needs of women and vulnerable groups and how they might differ from men.

6. Ensure that the design of **infrastructure** (buses, shelters, charging stations) is inclusive for people with disabilities and for women, keeping. Ensure gender and vulnerability safeguards during construction of charging stations and bus procurement.

7. Ensure that the **affordability** aspects of the integrated system are continued in the new e-bus system.

8. Use **awareness and training to improve safety and GBV response** and prevention through trainings and safety equipment inside buses and in transit areas. Improve usage of complaints handling and hotline systems through information dissemination and trainings. Transjakarta has a 24 call center for complaints and information services, each shelter also has a complaints box. Besides this, complaints can be reported to an officer on the bus or security at the shelter. However, procedures should be adequately implemented as both customers and drivers/shelter staff are not always aware of procedures. Trans Jakarta can also ensure that any contractor and subcontractor firms hired have zero tolerance of sexual misconduct and GBV in their employment.

---

\(^{75}\) Organizations involved include Digital Globe, Universidad del Desarrollo, Telefonica Research, and Development Centre, and the ISI Foundation.

\(^{76}\) UN Women, 2019.
Medium to longer term measures beyond the 100 E-Bus Trial project

9. Improve gender balanced recruitment and diversity representation among TransJakarta planners and engineers and female bus drivers. This can be done using improved recruitment, retention and promotion methods as described in detail in Annex 4.

10. Gender and LNOB representation can also be addressed through more upstream areas such as in decision making and board rooms, and through such as improved linkages with vocational training centres, schools, and universities. In particular to join efforts with “inclusive STEM” activities for improving women’s entry into transport and engineering. To compliment such efforts, the importance of gender and leaving no one behind can be brought up during the high-level meetings with city leaders where possible.

11. TransJakarta can initiate efforts alone or in partnership with civil society organizations to push through regulation that recognizes sexual harassment in public transport. Currently, the lack of regulation most seriously hampers authorities in dealing with sexual harassment on public transportation when the harassment occurs. Thus, each public transportation management such as TransJakarta has its own standard operational procedures about what to do when it happens, but when they do handle it and report it to the police the police do not know what sanctions to impose or how to deal with it because there is no regulation77.

---

ANNEX 1 POLICIES ON GENDER EQUALITY AND SOCIAL INCLUSION IN TRANSPORT IN INDONESIA

The Government of Indonesia has adopted a number of laws, policies, standards and initiatives pertaining to gender equity and marginalized populations. Regarding people with disabilities, Law No.25/2009 on Public Services (2009): Article 29 requires public service providers to provide special treatment to persons with disabilities in accordance with regulations. Law No. 4/1997 on Persons with Disabilities and Government Regulation 43/1998 on Efforts to improve the Social Welfare of Persons with Disabilities (1997/1998) establishes a quota of 1% for the employment of persons with disabilities in the public and private sector; states that “every disabled person has equal rights and opportunities in all aspects of life”; and lists various rights accorded to persons with disabilities such as education, employment, equal treatment, accessibility, rehabilitation.

However, the enforcement of these laws is weak. Indonesia has not provided comprehensive disability access in most modes of transportation. Even though there has been an increase in the number of public services that give access to persons with disabilities, most bus services in Indonesia are not wheelchair-friendly (e.g., limited space for those with wheelchair, no standardized path to enter the bus). The same problems are also faced by pedestrians. Most pedestrian paths are unsafe and impassable; most of them are damaged and very difficult for wheelchairs to access.

Similarly, several social assistance programs are already core parts of the Government’s commitment to protect the vulnerable in urban and rural areas alike, but these are also subject to inclusion errors and risk of politicization. Core social assistance programs today include the conditional cash transfer program (Program Keluarga Harapan, PKH), a cash transfer for poor and vulnerable students (Program Indonesia Pintar, PIP), food assistance (Sembako), and a subsidized health insurance premium waiver (JKN-PBI). The sector has improved spending allocation and built up platforms needed to deliver programs effectively and efficiently, such as a social registry for targeting, effective payment mechanisms and a significant cadre of facilitators on the ground, among other things. Social insurance exists for formal workers (Jaminan Sosial Tenaga Kerja, or Jamsostek) covering work related accidents, health care, old age and death.

Further improvements are required in the design, administration, and targeting of such provisions, to avoid biases and improve their impact, and this applies to the transport sector equally. Lack of analysis on the differentiating impacts, on men, women, boys and girls of existing programs in Indonesia (apart from some beneficiary incidence analysis) precludes drawing further conclusions. Some key elements that could disproportionately burden women and groups likely to be left behind include financial

---

78 Ibid.
80 Research, based on 47 key informant interviews and 4 participatory workshops with sub-national officials, points to key challenges that need to be reflected and addressed in social protection frameworks and their effective implementation.
access and literacy as it mediates access and usage of social protection. For example, women’s lack of access to formal banks affects how they interact with payment mechanisms for social assistance. Women tend to have lower financial literacy than men due to their lower level of education on average. According to the 2016 Financial Inclusion Index (FII) data, only 14% of the population demonstrated financial literacy, defined as holding basic knowledge of four fundamental concepts in financial decision-making (interest rates, interest compounding, inflation, and risk diversification). Furthermore, 40% of Indonesian women compared to 28% men feel that banking procedures are complicated for women to receive finance.

In terms of gender equality, the current administration under President Joko Widodo puts strong emphasis, elaborated in the 2020–2024 National Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMN 2020–2014). The process began in 2000 with a Presidential Decree on Gender Mainstreaming, with the Ministry for Women’s Empowerment (SMWE) as the Government’s principal advocate and provider of technical leadership in gender mainstreaming. Current strategies broadly include (1) improving the quality of life and role of women in development; (2) the protection of women from violence and trafficking; (3) institutional capacity for gender mainstreaming and protection of women against violence.

Policies promoting women’s representation in politics has also gained strength, though impact has remained within the ambit of central level political institutions. The number of women in the national parliament doubled between 1998 and 2018—and yet, at 19% this is still below the world average of 23%. At sub national level the figure is lower with the proportion of women in district parliaments only 14% in 2017, no female provincial governors, and only 6.7% women among mayors or bupati. On a positive note, 8 of 33 ministers are women—the highest %age there has ever been. Significantly, women now head up strategic ministries such as Finance, Foreign Affairs, Environment and Forestry, and Maritime Affairs and Fisheries, as well as social sector ministries to which they have been limited in the past.

Other progressive policies include gender and family/flexibility friendly policies at the workplace. Maternity leave with employers obliged to give their workers’ 90 days of paid leave is a formal policy. In terms of property rights, men and women have equal ownership rights. Finally, Indonesia has been proactive in passing laws protecting migrant workers, a significant %age of whom are women. Nonetheless, the effective implementation of formal laws is hampered by the presence of explicitly discriminatory laws as well as the presence of legal pluralism - multiple sources of informal and formal laws that the population (or a part of it) recognizes as a source of law.

---

83 FAO, 2019.
85 Marriage Law places men and head of household; inheritance laws favour sons and disadvantage widows; and polygamy is still legal under various circumstances. See Schaner and Theys, 2020.
ANNEX 2 DEFINITIONS AND KEY CONCEPTS USED IN THE STUDY

**Gender Equality:** Gender equality means that women and men have equal conditions for realizing their full human rights and for contributing to, and benefiting from, economic, social, cultural and political development. Gender equality exists when men and women are able to share equally in the distribution of power and influence. They have equal opportunities for human endowments (education & skills, health care) for economic resources (jobs, equal pay and promotion opportunity, finance, land, technology, information), for agency and decision making (ability to become political representatives, participation in various forms of planning, leadership positions in the workplace, shared responsibility for the home and children, and opportunity to develop personal ambitions, interests and talents) and are completely free from coercion, intimidation and gender-based violence both at work and at home. Gender equality is therefore the equal valuing by society of the similarities and the differences of men and women, and the roles they play. It is based on women and men being full partners in their home, their community and their society. To ensure fairness, measures must often be put in place to compensate for the historical and social disadvantages that prevent women and men from operating in a level playing field (FAO 2019).

**People with Disabilities:** People who have mental or physical impairments that adversely affects their ability to carry out everyday activities on a substantial, long-term basis. These impairments can be visible or invisible. Disabilities can affect a person’s mobility, manual dexterity, physical coordination, continence, ability to lift or carry objects, speech, hearing, eyesight, memory, and ability to concentrate, learn, or understand. Around 15% of the global population has some sort of disability, and prevalence is higher in developing countries (World Bank 2020).

**Gender-Based Violence (GBV):** An umbrella term for any harmful act that is perpetrated against a person’s will and stems from socially ascribed (i.e. gender-based) differences between males, females, and people who do not conform with gender norms. GBV includes acts that inflict physical, mental, or sexual harm or suffering; threats of such acts; and coercion and other deprivations of liberty, whether occurring in public or private life (IASC Guidelines, 2015, modified).

**Leaving No One Behind (LNOB):** “the pledge to 'leave no one behind' is made in the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). It entails ending extreme poverty in all its forms and reducing inequalities among both individuals (vertical) and groups (horizontal). Key to ‘leave no one behind’ is the prioritization and fast-tracking of actions for the poorest and most marginalized people – known as progressive universalism (UNDP 2018b).
ANNEX 3 SPATIAL POVERTY DISAGGREGATION WITHIN JAKARTA

Though metropolitan cores have the lowest rates of poverty and vulnerability (14.6%) while non-metro rural areas have the highest (37.5%), the rural peripheries of metro areas, despite their proximity to cities, have the second highest incidence rate of poverty and vulnerability (31.2%). The growth of urban areas has given rise to negative congestion forces, associated with the pressure of urban populations on infrastructure, housing, health, sanitation and the environment, that are undermining the liveability of cities. Given this larger context, this report is a contribution to ensuring that transport policy and the present project is attentive to the needs of women and the vulnerable.

Table 2: Poverty Rates in Jakarta

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City/District</th>
<th>Poverty Rate (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>South Jakarta City</td>
<td>3.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Jakarta City</td>
<td>3.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Jakarta City</td>
<td>4.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Jakarta City</td>
<td>3.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Jakarta City</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seribu Islands</td>
<td>11.56</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: BPS 2015
Figure 6. Where are the poor and vulnerable located in Jakarta? (Share of total poor and vulnerable by place, %)

Source: World Bank 2018
ANNEX 4 TENTATIVE GENDER ACTION PLAN

A.4.1 Introduction

Overall, the 100 E-Bus Trial Project has a tremendous potential for positive impacts on women and vulnerable groups. The enhancement in accessibility, affordability, improved safety, and representation of women and marginalized groups will improve women’s and other marginalized populations’ connectivity, access to employment opportunities, markets, services, and other daily spatial needs.

Beyond transport, in the longer term, the reduction in GHG emissions and therefore the improved air quality, will improve health conditions. This will also have positive impacts on future human capital accumulation of younger generation as improved health leads to better education opportunities and livelihood prospects\textsuperscript{86}. The benefits of renewable energy use and climate change mitigation efforts, that this project promotes, will contribute to reduced risks for natural disasters. Women and vulnerable groups will benefit most as their safety nets are typically lower and their adaptation ability is lower. Thus, the lowering of such climate induced disasters and risks will produce maximum long-term benefits for them.

A.4.2 Tentative Gender Action Plan

Elements of a Tentative Gender Action Plan to harness these positive impacts the project should consider the following eight actions:

\textit{Figure 7. Elements of a Tentative Gender Action Plan}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ACTIVITIES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 Carry out a workshop/webinar to introduce the Gender Action Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Test the scope of the Gender Action Plan before finalizing indicators and budget, and obtain buy-in. It is important that the right (strategically placed) individuals participate in the workshop; that stakeholders see the big picture across proposed activities; that they get interested in the process and see benefits to their organization. The workshop should also introduce the basics of ‘why’ and ‘how to’ of mainstreaming gender to project staff and share good practice across countries. Assistance can be obtained from relevant gender expert or firm.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. If the management in TransJakarta is not conscious of gender issues, or considers them not their task, or if gender-consciousness in staff is not acknowledged by the management, then little progress can be made. Given the low rate of gender related training, this is a possibility. The project could help develop staff appraisals that could also include an informal or even a formal appreciation of gender-conscious approaches, based on staff performance evaluations, of an increased degree of participation in training activities by both women and men; and on gender sensitivity and equity in activities, outputs and results produced by staff. Once capacity building needs have been identified by the project, more concrete action plans can be developed in this section.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{86} Can be linked to the C40 Cities: Benefits of Urban Climate Action: Jakarta Electric Buses Study (Draft Report May 2020).
4.2.2 Improve data collection efforts on the transport and mobility use and needs of women and vulnerable groups and how they might differ from men or the assumed standard.

For example, the 2009 installation of the Trans Semarang, a Bus Rapid Transit system in Semarang City, data on travel use and access by men and women was collected to make the Trans Semarang more gender-responsive, resulting in installation of more lighting at stops and more seating and improved access for women.

4.2.3 Ensure that the design of infrastructure (buses, shelters, charging stations) is inclusive for people with disabilities and for women, keeping in mind gender-based violence

   a. Ensure charging stations and bus stops are planned following existing guidelines on safety (or in absence of it) in places where land use patterns enable vigilance. Location of bus stop should never be at an isolated/lonely place. Bus stop should be ideally located at a point where natural surveillance is possible through shops and other mixed land uses.
   b. Internal lighting for vehicles which should be left on every evening, all through the ride, as opposed to only during fair collection.
   c. Provision of well-lit charging stations staffed with security personnel.
   d. Pedestrian-scale lighting around bus stops/transit shelters and around charging stations.
   e. Fully transparent windows should be present to allow women to scan their surroundings.
   f. Ensure commuters feel comfortable enough to alight include announcements at every stop as well as the upcoming stop. Loud music that hinders efficient communication between commuters should be avoided especially when women need to raise an alarm of harassment or request a drop off.
   g. Ensure posters are placed inside vehicles with information such as names of major stages along the route for information for different destinations and anytime specific fare changes. Ensure that all the different types of vehicles follow this rule especially the privately-owned vehicles and the minibuses.
      a. Pay adequate attention to issues of lighting, openness, visibility, crowd, security, walk path for infrastructure design.

4.2.4 Ensure that the affordability aspects of the integrated system are continued in the new e-bus system.

Decisions to make E-Buses part of Jaklingko should be made with adequate assessment of how it impacts financially on consumers, especially poorer beneficiaries.

4.2.5 Ensure gender and vulnerability safeguards during construction of charging stations and bus procurement

   a. Ensure proper handling and storage of construction materials/raw material as well as accidents and give due attention to worker and pedestrian safety.
   b. Develop and carry out skills training for women on jobs related to the construction works. Ensure equal pay for work.
   c. Ensure there is a gender sensitization training and its proper implementation during construction of works.

4.2.6 Improve gender balance and diversity representation among TransJakarta planners and engineers and female bus drivers
The ILO 2013 “career cycle approach” also offers a useful guide to increasing women’s participation in the transport sector. This chart focuses on working conditions and the human resources policies of transport service provider is designed to mainstream gender. It describes opportunities for success and advancement while also recognizing the barriers faced by women in education and training and level of social support available to those who work in the transport sector.

a. Examine human resource policies on recruitment, retention, and promotion and assess whether they look at skills gaps and leadership in TransJakarta, as well as among other operators.

b. Enhance decision-making opportunities for women and continue the existing gender-based hiring quotas for bus operators. Active labour market programs that address women’s constraints to find a job are likely to be particularly important, given that there are still sizeable portions of unmarried (50%) and married (25%) women who report that they want a job.

c. Promote a gender and inclusion conscious workplace in the TransJakarta network (among organizational partners) with the following elements:
   i. Re-organizing working hours so that staff members are better able to attend to family responsibilities. For example, establishing a definite ‘quitting time’ or allowing staff the option of ‘flex-time’; setting up policies on maternity and paternity leave; providing appropriate facilities that respond to gender-based needs including childcare or separate lavatories for women and men.
   ii. Demonstrating gender-sensitive behaviour. For example, in the language used, comments that are made, images or materials displayed, meeting practices. Gender sensitivity in staff recruitment and training.
   iii. Spreading travel responsibilities widely among staff.
   iv. Securing the health and safety of staff. For example, by establishing mechanisms to deal with sexual harassment, providing safe transportation for women, limiting travel that pregnant and nursing women are required to do or giving staff the right to refuse assignments that pose undue risk.
   v. Addressing gender issues in all interviews, job descriptions and performance reviews.

87 ITF, 2019.
Encouraging a gender-sensitive management style and promoting mutual respect for diverse working or management styles.

d. Increase economic opportunities for women and excluded groups through the E-Bus service delivery chain.

e. Promote women entrepreneurs in developing local small business development around charging stations.

f. Partner with local universities targeting science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM) graduates with information and incentives that would break any preconceived barriers to applying/entering transport sector.

4.2.7 Ensure that any contractor and subcontractor firms hired have zero tolerance of sexual misconduct and GBV in their employment policies

a. In collaboration with safeguard and communications specialists, conduct awareness-raising activities on gender-based violence mitigation training - with bus users and identify what security items are already in place and what the gaps are.

b. Ensure safe and ethical reporting mechanisms have been established to report grievances or cases.

c. Provide gender sensitization and training to stakeholders at all levels – including bus operators, charging station workers, TransJakarta personnel and Government Departments. Such training can be a series of two or three workshops or online courses mandated for completion in due time. For example, in Kenya each privately owned mini bus owner is responsible for adjustments to internal lighting, cameras, exterior painting and graffiti, seating arrangement, internal signs. They are responsible for “building” safety in the vehicles in this manner. The privately owned minibuses that TJ works with can also form part of sexual-harassment training in this manner to build a safe vehicle environment and infrastructure.

d. Initiatives can be launched to encourage bystander actions which can range from calling text messaging or otherwise alerting authorities physically stepping in to help the victims, trying to communicate with the fender and or recording the incident on a mobile device for evidence. Training on the safest and most effective ways to intervene in such situations can be provided through the escalation and violence interruption workshops.

4.2.8 Stress the importance of gender and leaving no one behind during the high-level meetings with city leaders where possible.

For example, during the CFF facilitated meeting with city leaders for presenting products and work plan as planned in the project Terms of Reference.

a. Create an additional goal of creating budget space for gender sensitizing infrastructure models, planning of transport systems, and monitoring and evaluation.

b. Provide gender sensitization training to women and men employees in the E-Bus supply chain specifically through peer-to-peer learning or through women’s organizations. Such training can work with ride-hailing app companies, public transport services, schools and campuses to provide training on gender-based violence.

c. Work with women’s groups to educate women on consumer feedback mechanisms and increase women’s engagement in consumer feedback, including reporting of any gender-based harassment and violence.

---

88 ITF, 2019.
89 A growing number of civil society organizations in Jakarta are working on ending gender-based violence in public transport. For example, “Hollaback” works to train GoJek drivers on understand forms of harassment, but also take an active part in intervening against harassment.
### ANNEX 5 LIST OF INDIVIDUALS CONSULTED

#### A.5.1 Individuals Consultations

Details of the Individuals consulted are provided in Table 3.

**Table 3: List of Individuals Consulted**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Issue Area</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. TransJakarta</td>
<td>Capacity building and knowledge management expert</td>
<td>9 April 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. TransJakarta</td>
<td>Data Management expert</td>
<td>9 April 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. TransJakarta</td>
<td>Division Head of Technical and E-Bus</td>
<td>4 April 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. TransJakarta</td>
<td>Department Head for E-Bus Trial and Licencing</td>
<td>4 April 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. TransJakarta</td>
<td>Department Head for Bus Technical Design and Standard</td>
<td>4 April 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. TransJakarta</td>
<td>Technical Design and Standard Department</td>
<td>4 April 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. TransJakarta</td>
<td>Director of Technical and Facility</td>
<td>4 April 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. ITDP</td>
<td>Gender Expert</td>
<td>May 22 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. ITDP</td>
<td>Project Coordinator (Transport Expert)</td>
<td>June 29 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Urban Catalyst</td>
<td>Gender Expert (Bangalore Project)</td>
<td>July 2 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Female Bus Drivers</td>
<td>Various bus types – minibuses, double deckers, BRT buses.</td>
<td>February 2021</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Consultants Team, February 2021
ANNEX 6 PRIMARY DATA COLLECTION AND ASSESSMENT

A.6.1 Gender organisational assessment

6.2.1 Introduction to respondents

This assessment is part of a short interview that we (GFA HEAT/GIZ project) is conducting to understand your experience of working as female drivers in TransJakarta. We aim to understand the organisation’s functioning, particularly in terms of integrating gender into processes and policies; identify existing capacities that can be drawn on, as well as gaps in capacities that need to be addressed, in the gender mainstreaming process; and suggest ways to promote gender equality within an organisation.

This discussion is for research purposes only, and all the information obtained will be kept safe in our files and will be anonymous completely. You will not be identified in any presentation of the study reports.

Also, you are free to refuse to answer any questions that you feel are not appropriate or that make you feel uncomfortable. You may ask us any questions about the study at any point during the discussion. Your participation or non-participation in the interview will not affect any services you currently receive.

6.2.2 Interview results

Table 4: Female Bus Driver Interview Questionnaire and illustrative Responses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>QUESTIONS &amp; RESPONSES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Do the buses you are operating have any of the following features inside the bus: CCTV, announcements, fare and route information?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• All TJ Busses are equipped with the CCTV inside that records everything. The driver even have the screen in which s/he can see the CCTV real time.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The route information is announced by recording, with every next bus stop name to alert passengers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Drive single maxi bus. It is equipped with CCTV. Driver can see the CCTV. But not going to pay attention all the time. Route and bus stop are announced, but the fare is not. Passengers usually pay at the shelter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I have driven the double-decker bus, the single maxi bus and the tourism bus. All are equipped with CCTV. The route and bus stop are announced. Passengers usually know already the tariff before taking the bus.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I was a driver at TJ’s ex operator Jak Express trans Batavia. Drove tourist bus in 2016. Bus is equipped with CCTV.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Do you receive training related to gender?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Gender training has not been specifically arranged. Only general training for all drivers. Males and females.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• All the training provided is the same and has the same standard for male and female drivers. There is no easier test for females, including the driving skill test at all conditions. The training is general and there is no specific training on gender topics. The harassment policy is within a section of the material. In 2014, TJ installed separators between the passenger and the driver to reduce the risk of harassment and to prevent the passengers making too much communication with drivers. In 2015, TJ provided a women’s area inside the bus for those female passengers who prefer to stay next to males.
• Not specifically. All training is conducted together for male and female employees. All test parameters are the same even for the same road and operating time (for the evening for example).

3. Did you receive any training on sexual harassment in buses?
• No. When joining, this issue is not as important as it is now. All passengers are mixed in the bus. Now the sexual harassment topic is included in the training material, and TJ has acted to provide women’s areas, and an event women’s bus (pink bus). Would love to receive gender training at TJ.

4. Are you aware of reporting mechanisms and how to respond?
• Commonly, the victim can instantly confront the doer, and they will be forced to get off at the next stop in which TJ officer will act on doer’s crime.
• There is a security officer working in every shelter. There is CCTV in the shelter and in the bus. There is customer complaint hotline to which customers can report any inconvenient experiences.
• TJ encourage victims to speak up on the spot so it’s easier for the doer to be acted on. This also will be more effective to discourage other potential assaults or pickpockets to consider their action in advance.
• There is report centre number. But the passengers are encouraged to confront the assault on the spot to get them acted upon immediately.

5. Which was closest to their method of recruitment?
   a) Friend (word of mouth)
   b) Online /offline advertisement
   c) From previous workplace recommendation
   d) Training centre/ school advertisement

• Word of mouth. I started becoming a female driver at TJ’s operator.
• I am an ex-driver of Jakarta Express Trans, at that time TJ’s operator; I joined in 2006. In 2014 TJ bought several operators. I re-applied to TJ as a women driver. It was the program of the former governor of Jakarta, Sutiyoso to recruit more women drivers to improve the image of TJ and encourage more customers especially women, using the service.
• In 2016, tourist bus are merged with TJ and all drivers are females. I have a friend who is also a female driver, and she informed me on how to apply
to Jakarta Trans Metro, at that time TJ’s Operator. Now I joined TJ when Trans Metro was bought.  
- Own initiative. Once I rode the TJ and had a conversation with the female driver. Not too long after, I read an opening for female driver for TJ as part of former governor Sutiyoso’s recruitment program.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>6. What are the main causes of the low number of female drivers? (tick as many as applicable)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) Skills and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Confidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Working Hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) Other?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- It relates more to the number of applications from female applicants. Still many women consider it difficult to drive bus and consider this as male work.  
- TJ has not accepting women drivers over the past 2 years. No sure of the exact reasoning behind this. However, TJ’s operators are still accepting female drivers, and this can be an option for the prospective female drivers.  
- TJ very much welcome to female drivers and encourage them to apply. Its more an issue of the lack of women applying for driver positions, due to lack of confidence.  
- Family factor, more females are not too confident to able to drive a bus. They still consider driving a bus is more of a male profession.  
- Perhaps TJ have their own consideration with regards to the skills. It’s a little unfortunate that during the COVID situation, there are more female drivers that are sent home.

Source: Heat GFA February 2021


CEDAW Report 2014


Interparliamentary Union: Women in Politics 2017 and KPU, 2014

International Labour Organization (ILO) Inclusion of People with Disabilities in Indonesia.


Ministry of Women’s Empowerment and Child Protection, 2017


National Women’s Life Experiences Survey, 2017


Sustainable Urban Transport Project (SUTP), Approaches for Gender Responsive Urban Mobility, 2018
https://jakartaglobe.id/business/women-seek-greater-role-in-indonesia-transportation-industry/


SAKERNAS 2018 Indonesia National Labour Force Survey


SUSENAS 2017 Indonesia National Socioeconomic Survey


World Economic Forum. 2018. Gender Gap Index

United Nations Development Program. 2018. Gender Development Index and Gender Inequality Index.


1. Utilizing the more electricity efficient type of E-Bus.